

To Accreditation Council  
of Eurasian Center  
for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance  
In Higher Education and Health Care

December 29, 2021

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME 7R01135 – “EMERGENCY AND DISASTER MEDICINE” OF  
NJSC "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR  
COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF  
RESIDENCE)  
IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

**external expert evaluation period: December 13-15, 2021**

**Almaty city, 2021**

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01135 "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the review of the self-assessment report of educational programme in the specialty 7R01135 "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and Conclusions	5
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	The results of the survey of teachers and residents	12
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment educational programme in the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"	15
6.	Recommendations for improvement of educational programme in the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"	26
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	27
	Attachment 1. Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation and Educational Programme of Residency in the Specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"	28
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	29
	Attachment 3. Organization visit programme	31

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Decryption
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD	Government Decree
NJSC KRMU	Non-state educational institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
SCES	State compulsory educational standard
university	institution of higher education
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Committee for Educational Programmes
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
teaching staff	Teaching staff
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DPCEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CMI	Control measuring instruments
QEP	The quality of the educational process
AC	Attestation commission
RIEP	Resident's Individual Educational plan
RIWT	Resident Independent work under the supervision of a teacher
SIW	Student Independent work (resident)
AP	Academic plan
WC	Working Curriculum
TEP	Typical educational Plan
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Regulations
EMC	Emergency medical care
PHC	Primary Health Care
MED	Emergency and Disaster Medicine
MTB	Material and technical base
MD	Major disciplines

## 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 32 dated November 23, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties of the National Educational Institution "KRMU" on December 13-15, 2021, including specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" "in the following composition:

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission	ZHANALINA BAKHYT SEKERBEKOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry of the NJSK "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Excellence in Public Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan tel.
foreign expert	OLEG MIKHAILOVICH URYASIEV, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with Courses of Endocrinology, General Physiotherapy, Clinical Pharmacology, Occupational Diseases and Military Field Therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the "Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov" of the Ministry of Health of Russia.
National academic expert	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, Leading Researcher of JSC "Scientific Center of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty
Expert - representative of employers	MUSABAYEVA ASEM MURATOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chief Physician of the Municipal State Enterprise on REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" of the Public Health Department of Almaty City, MBA, organizer of health care of the highest qualification category
Expert - representative of residents	ZIA AZIMKHAN NURZHANYLY Resident of the third year of study in the specialty "Urology and andrology for adults, children" JSC "Scientific Center of Urology named after Academician B.U. Dzharbusynov"

*ECAQA Observer-* Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, head of the accreditation and monitoring department of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care".

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" and recommendations to the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	"Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University " NJSC National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
Government	Authorized body: Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first head	Jainakbaev N.T., Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Phone: +7 727 250 83 75, Fax: +7 727 250 83 75, e-mail: <a href="mailto:info@medkrmu.kz">info@medkrmu.kz</a>
date of creation	1992
Location and contact details	Abylai Khan Avenue, 51/53, 1st floor, Almaty, <a href="https://2gis.kz/almaty/firm/70000001031652688/center/76.9398%2C43.2651/zoom/16.7204">https://2gis.kz/almaty/firm/70000001031652688/center/76.9398%2C43.2651/zoom/16.7204</a>
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 02, 2010
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	No
Starting year of the accredited educational programme (EP)	In 2014, there was the first set of residents in the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine".
Duration of study	2 years
The total number of graduates since the start of the EP	14
Number of residents at the EP since the beginning of the current year	5
Full-time teachers/ Part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % degree	Full-time teachers - 2, including 1 - associate professor, 1 master of science The degree of full-time teachers is 50%, part-time teachers are involved, where the degree is 100%

KazRossMedUniversity (hereinafter referred to as the University or KRMU) is the first private university in the Republic of Kazakhstan and was founded in 1992. For 30 years, the University has maintained its status as a socially responsible and innovative higher education institution by consistently expanding the range of educational activities and covering all levels of education (higher, postgraduate and additionally). Confidence in the university on the part of practical health care and science is expressed in documented cooperation with almost all medical organizations in Almaty and many medical and preventive institutions of the Almaty region, professional associations and research centers.

The main emphasis in international cooperation is on collaboration with medical educational institutions of the Russian Federation, and today more than 10 cooperation agreements have been concluded. This is natural, since the direction along "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" is well developed in Russia and there is extensive experience in providing assistance to the population in various emergency situations. In this regard, the KRMU has the opportunity to send both teachers and the most responsible and successful residents to Russian institutions to improve their skills and exchange experience.

Implementation of the programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" and the first recruitment of residents was in 2014 is due to the fact that there were changes in the classifier of residency specialties and the university itself participated in justifying the need to introduce such a specialty into the classifier.

I state the fact that the specialty is exclusive and requires a graduate to have a wide range of knowledge in related specialties (therapy, pediatrics, gynecology, urology, surgery / traumatology, dermatology, health care organization, epidemiology, infectious diseases, etc.), as well as relevant practical skills and personal qualities (stress resistance, quick response and decision-making, strategic thinking and communication). Therefore, the set of residents is usually small, approximately 2-3 people per year, and the training period is also short - 2 years. Currently, there are 5 residents studying at the KRMU in an accredited specialty.

Thus, the educational programme of the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" is aimed at training competitive specialists in the field of Emergency and Disaster Medicine, able to meet the needs of society in performing the scope of work on medical support of the population in emergency situations, apply and develop advanced innovative technology in practice and science, use the achievements of information and communication technologies.

The requirements for the level of training of residency graduates in the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" are formulated in the educational programme in accordance with: The State Compulsory Standard for Residency in Medical Specialties and the Model Professional Curriculum for Medical Specialties of Residency (Order of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated July 31, 2015 . Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan); the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" (Article 36 "Postgraduate Education"); Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI "On the health of the people and the health care system" and other regulatory legal acts in the field of education and health care.

The implementation of the educational programme is carried out in accordance with the internal regulations of the university: Rules for admission to residency; academic policy; Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students; Academic calendar of educational residency programmes; Individual work plan of the residency trainee.

## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

To date, accreditation of the educational programme 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" was not carried out.

## **2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the self-assessment report of educational programme 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Educational Organizations and Conclusions**

Report on self-esteem 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" (hereinafter referred to as the report) presented on 121 pages of the main text, appendices on 13 pages and electronic versions of documents located at the link <http://www.iaar.kz/ru/accreditation-ru/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya#>

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 basic accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. Accompanying the report is a letter signed

by the rector, Professor Dzhaynakbaev N.T., which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report has list of 9 members in internal commission for self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for the self-assessment of the educational programme - Bekmagambetova Zh.M., Head of the Strategic Development and Accreditation Department.

Self-assessment of the educational program 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" was held on the basis of the order of the rector No. 26-02-50 / 1-n / k dated 07/01/2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Magzumova Raushangul Ziyadinovna, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

Standards	Reviewer recommendations
5	Include information about the Hirsch index of teachers in the report. Plan to conduct advanced training courses for teachers leading such disciplines of the programme as "Organization and basics of the activity of the disaster medicine service", "Epidemiology of disasters", "Civil protection and organization of medical care in emergency situations".
6	As a recommendation, use the clinical base of the Center for Disaster Medicine of the MED of the Republic of Kazakhstan

In the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, the experts received answers to the questions that arose, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report based on the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards reflect real practice of NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for the preparation of residents by specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", taking into account the start of enrollment of students in 2014, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently completed and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc

The report is presented to ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables contain links in the text and are numbered consecutively.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the National Institution "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care» No. 5 of February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved in 2021 by ECAQA Director general Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector Jainakbaev. Dates of the visit to the organization: December 13-15, 2021

Sequence of implementation of visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - a total of 27 people;
- interviews with residents in the accredited specialty - 4 (out of 5) people (see table below),
- website exploration <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/>
- interviewing 5 teachers participating in the implementation of the accredited educational programme, including 3 part-time teachers;
- questioning of teachers and residents (all specialties included in the cluster of accreditation expertise) -67 and 177 respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending a practical lesson on the topic “Closed fracture of the lower limb”, senior lecturer Sadvokasov Z.K., residents of the 2nd year.
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 1 unit. both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents examined is in Attachment 2).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews was ensured (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC

No.	FULL NAME.	Position
1.	Dzhaynakbaev Nurlan Temirbekovich	Rector, professor
2.	Kusainova Arman Saylavbekovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
3.	Imanbaeva Zhaisan Abilseitovna	Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work
4.	Sovostyanova Tatyana Anatolyevna	Acting vice-rector for educational work
5.	Imanbayeva Zhaysan Abilseitovna,	Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work;
6.	Orakbay Lyazzat Zhadigerovna,	head of residency department
7.	Kulebaeva Elmira Kuanyshevna	Chief of Career Center
8.	Iskakova Dana Askarovna	Head of the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility
9.	Veryovkina Vera Ivanovna	Chiefpersonnel department;
10.	Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna,	Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry;
11.	Orakbay Lyazzat Zhadigerovna,	head of residency department
12.	Veryovkina Vera Ivanovna,	Chiefpersonnel department
13.	Vdovtsev Alexander Viktorovich	Responsible for mobile medical complexes (QEP)
14.	Kerimbekova Asel Almasovna,	Department of Distance Educational Technologies
15.	Mokhirev Alexander Anatolievich	Department of Distance Educational Technologies
16.	Seydalin Arystan Oskarovich.	Department head
17.	Mansharipova Alma Toleuovna	Scientific Secretary,
18.	Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna,	head of the center
19.	Dzhusupov S.M.	resident of the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"
20.	Omarbek N.A.	resident of the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"



21.	Tastanov S.K.	resident of the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"
22.	Shambilova R.N.	resident of the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"

Thus, during the implementation of the programme activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory and advisory body in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. In a conversation with the university management, experts received information about why the educational programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine» introduced into the educational process. This is due to the fact that when holding meetings with representatives of practical health care during republican and international conferences and round tables organized at the university itself, doctors made suggestions about the need for the graduates of the KRMU to develop the skills to provide assistance to the population affected by emergencies (rural , earthquakes, floods and other natural disasters), especially since Almaty is located in the seismically hazardous zone of the republic. Having close cooperation with representatives of the medical community of Russia, in particular with the AI of emergency pediatric surgery and traumatology, where assistance is provided to children not only with "ordinary" injuries, but also as a result of emergencies, the Rector of KRMU, prof. N.T.Dzhainakbayev initiated the development of a residency program in the specialty "Medicine of emergencies and disasters".

Most of the participants in the educational process know the mission of the university, at the same time, residents did not say that they were involved in formulating the mission of the educational programme. Individual teachers and staff took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, newsletters to medical organizations.

The experts reviewed the strategic plan of the organization for the period of 2025, including such areas as improving the material and technical equipment and international cooperation to improve the quality of the educational process, which confirms fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, they say where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, and training facilities. This indicates compliance with **standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

Given that the programme was introduced into the educational process 7 years ago, the university could timely organize the participation of residents in a number of processes related to the educational programme (development, formation of electives, proposals for improvement). Feature of the residency specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" is that it is not implemented in all universities of Kazakhstan, and at the same time, this is an extremely relevant specialty at the present time. An analysis of the content of the educational programme showed that it was compiled in accordance with the State Educational Standards and is designed for 140 credits (major disciplines - 132 credits, an elective component - 4 credits, intermediate certification - 2 credits, final certification - 2 credits). Most disciplines are evenly distributed and have approximately the same number of credits, such as Emergency Medicine and Pediatrics, Emergency Surgery, Emergency Traumatology and Fundamentals of Anesthesiology in Disaster Medicine with 11 credits each discipline. Epidemiology of disasters - 12 credits, Civil protection and organization of medical care in emergency situations - 15 credits and Toxicology and radiobiology - 13 credits. The disciplines "Organization and basics of the activity of the disaster medicine service" and "Emergency first aid in emergencies" have the largest number of credits, 23 and 25 credits each, respectively.

The university has educational and methodological complexes for the disciplines of the educational programme, designed in a unified way and syllabuses, which are provided to residents in electronic form before the start of training.

During the external visit, the experts held a meeting with 4 residents and 2 full-time teachers in charge of the programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", where it was found that the residents were satisfied with the structure of the programme and teaching methods. Thematic seminars are held weekly, residents have access to the equipment and patients of clinical bases, in the classroom they consider emergency situations and discuss algorithms of action, in the simulation center they practice skills in emergency care for various categories of patients. The residents said that after completing the 2-year programme, they will receive a certificate with the qualification of a "doctor of emergency and disaster medicine", a certificate of completion of residency with admission to independent practice as a doctor.

The experts did not attend practical classes under the accredited programme, since during the days of the visit the residents were engaged in clinical practice, and the experts were able to see directly in the clinics how they work, keep medical records, and communicate with patients and medical staff. At the same time, during a conversation with residents, evidence was obtained that the seminar was held according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher.

According to the interviewed residents, ethics and respect are observed at the department, while before the start of training, teachers introduce them to the Code of Ethics. This document is also available on the website of the university. During the training, there were no incidents related to violation of ethics or corruption issues.

Having visited the educational and clinical (simulation) center of the KRMU, the experts noted that both according to the self-assessment report and during a visual inspection, it was found that over the past 2 years the material and technical equipment has been significantly updated, there is all the necessary equipment for the formation and development of skills in providing emergency assistance to the victims. In simulation sessions, residents practice the skills of a doctor in emergency situations, in particular, they discuss algorithms for the mass appearance of injured or sick people. Simulate situations such as mass trauma, burns, poisoning. The most interesting questions to study according to the residents are long-term squeezing syndrome, Radiation sickness. Important in the current epidemic situation, they consider the tactics of the doctor in the context of the emergence of mass infectious diseases.

The study of control and measuring tools showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. When interviewed, residents of the 2nd year of study: Sultan Dzhusupov and Ryskul Shambilovatold about the evaluation forms, and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system for appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document and there were no cases of appeal during the period of work of the educational organization. Thus, a correspondence has been established the **standard 3**. At the same time, teachers noted that they plan to develop special assessment materials to assess knowledge and skills in medical intelligence in an emergency area), organizing evacuation and evacuation of victims from an emergency area, monitoring the readiness of medical institutions and units to work in emergency situations, predicting the occurrence of emergencies and planning actions to eliminate the medical consequences of emergencies. The wish of the experts was that when updating the content of the educational programme, the current needs of practical health care should be taken into account and the methods of providing emergency medical care in emergency situations would be improved.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with the employee, the commission made sure that there is a documenting system is available to all faculty and staff, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, contracts with faculty and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools ( checklists, statements), certificates, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that the necessary documents for residents are posted on its pages and the information is regularly updated. This information was obtained from interviews with employees.

The admission of residents is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules and the selection of residents takes into account their previous academic achievements, especially in surgery, emergency

care. Based on the results of studying the material on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers, no violations were found (standards 4 and 5). There are 5 residents in total.

Considering that the main goal of the programme is to provision of medical care to victims in emergency situations of a natural, man-made and social nature, with the introduction of a state of emergency, under the guidance and supervision of a clinical mentor, experts held meetings with teachers (today 1 full-time teacher, until 2020 there were 2 full-time teachers) and part-time teachers acting as a mentor. Part-timers are **clinic doctors**.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. The university maintains a teacher/resident ratio of 1:3. At the same time, experts expressed the opinion that residents of the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" are not sufficiently engaged in scientific work, but they have a desire and need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

During the Visits at clinical sites experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with the training programme, accessibility for teachers and residents. The equipment and its compliance with the needs of students and practical health care have been studied. Experts received evidence of implementation of **standard 6**, as well as information from the self-assessment report.

In the courtyard in front of the main educational building of the KRMU there are 2 mobile medical complexes (QEP), which were demonstrated to the experts: "Mobile Diagnostic Center" and "Hemodialysis Point". When preparing residents in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", it uses 5 types of QEP as a training laboratory. For example, a hemodialysis station is extremely important in caring for a crash victim.

The programme of the experts' visit included a visit to the test center and the library. There are no comments for the test center. The library interested the experts, as the residents are provided with conditions for self-improvement and obtaining up-to-date information. The library has a connection to the largest electronic resources - Cochrane Library, Medicine and Health care in Russia, IPRbooks, Polpred.com, ThomsonReuters, Springer Link, ELSEVIER, Scopus and Science Direct, Kazakhstan National Electronic Library (KazNEL). The Hall of Electronic Resources was examined in the building at 71 Torekulova St., and the Electronic Library in the building at 53 Abylai Khan Avenue. In addition, when visiting the main building, residents can connect to the Internet, as there is Wi-Fi everywhere.

The Library operates a university electronic library programme ALLmaibook, an electronic catalog is being created. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients, holding international events.

Interview with conducted by employers in online mode and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 0% employment of residency graduates, etc.

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, clinical sites were visited, and employees of the educational organization provide collegial and ethical relationships with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients is provided, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and curators (mentors) provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

When implementing the activities of the programme of visiting the university, the experts found evidence that there is a satisfactory management of the residency programme, and the educational programme is provided with educational and methodological materials and resources, supported financially and the employment of graduates is 100%. The experts noted that despite the start of admission of residents in 2014, there was a break in the recruitment of residents during one academic year, but in 2020 admission was resumed and today 5 residents are studying. The programme is being evaluated for the first time under specialized accreditation and there are areas for improvement, including: professional training of teachers on the organization of the activities of the disaster medicine service, disaster epidemiology, civil protection and organization of medical care in emergency situations,

The experts drew attention to the fact that at present the educational programme in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" is practice-oriented, however, according to the residents, they need to hold more seminars where they could discuss and simulate various situations.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the members of the EEC was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria of educational programme 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the chairperson held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment as part of specialized accreditation.

#### **4. The results of the survey.**

During a visit to the university, an ECAQA observer conducted an online survey on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

For the purpose of objective assessment, a survey of residents and teachers was conducted on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

**Results of the poll of residents.** The survey of residents included 24 questions, allowing to draw conclusions about the attitude of respondents to the organization of the educational process and identify existing problems.

A total of 177 respondents were surveyed, including 90 residents of the KRMU (including 5 in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"), of which 42.2% are residents of the 1st year of study, 32.2% - 2 years of study, 25, 5% - 3 years of study. They will recommend to study in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives - 70.62% fully agree, partially agree - 23.73% totally disagree with this statement- 2.82%.

74.58% of respondents fully agree, 20.34% partially agree, 2.26% strongly disagree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their problems related to training. 72.88% of respondents believe that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies, and the rest (8.47%) are partially unaware (8.47%) of the respondents.

Satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of the university. Fully (66.1%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and auditoriums of the university. partially (25.9%) and completely dissatisfied (3.95%) with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms and auditoriums of the university.

In this educational organization, conditions have been created for students to rest and eat (rest

rooms, benches / pavilions on the territory, buffet-dining room) in between classes, they completely agree (68.93%), disagree (8.47%) of the respondents.

Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) is available for students in classrooms and practice bases, fully agree (69.41%), partially agree (19.21%).

According to 78.53% (fully) and 13.56% (partially) agree that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. 72.32% fully agree with the provision of the necessary educational literature, 14.69% partially agree.

The availability of medical services for the student is fully agreed (71.19), partially (26.38%) of the respondents. Satisfaction with the activities of mentors, curators, supervisors fully agree (81.5%), partially (10.5%). Teachers and employees of the educational organization treat students with respect Agree (91.53%), No Disagree (6.21%) of the respondents. Fully agree (75.71%) and disagree (5.65%) that the organization of education has and implements social programmes to support students. Fully agree (80.71%) and disagree (12.43%) that the educational organization has established a system of self-study for students and residents. Fully satisfied (81.36%) and partially satisfied (16.38%) respondents with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme. Completely satisfied (81, 36%) and partially satisfied (11.86%) with the methods of assessing their knowledge and skills. 73.45% of respondents believe that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, and 16.38% of respondents partially agree with the above statement. 88.47% of respondents answered that teachers are not late for classes, while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers are late for classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers were late for the start of classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers. while 8.47% of respondents sometimes noticed that teachers were late for the start of classes. 74.58% of respondents like to study in this educational organization, while 19.21% of respondents are partially satisfied. 80.23% of respondents answered that they do not notice the negative attitude of teachers, 11.3% of respondents answered that they partially (deservedly) encountered the negative attitude of teachers.

46.89% of the respondents answered that they are currently engaged in research work, 35.03% of respondents are not involved in research activities and 10.73% of respondents plan to start doing research activities.

38.98% of the respondents answered that they have more than one (11.38%) printed works (articles, abstracts, reviews) personally published during their studies at this educational institution, and (18.64%) do not have any one publication, articles, abstracts, reviews.

Conclusions: in their responses, residents generally expressed satisfaction with the university, learning conditions, access to diagnostic and educational equipment, and enough time for practical

training. Residents expect that the number of patients for curation will increase every year due to the expansion of the bases of clinical practice, the organization of training with field trips to the regions of the country, and the more active involvement of residents in the work of mobile medical complexes. Residents expressed hope that they would be more actively involved in the implementation of research and learn the rules of publications. The results of the survey showed that there are approximately 10-15% of respondents who are not satisfied with the methods of teaching and assessing their knowledge and skills, are not fully satisfied with the work of mentors and the provision of students with educational and methodological materials.

### **Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes.**

67 teaching staff were surveyed, with more than 10 years of experience (46.27%), 5-10 years - (13.43%).

Two of them are teachers in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" (pedagogical experience up to 10 years). 85.07% fully agree with the appropriate organization of the educational programme in this university, 10.45% - partially agree. Ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, management - 80.6% fully agree, and 13.43% partially agree. 76.12% of respondents fully agree on the issue of labor organization and workplace in the university, and 16.42% - partially.

79.1% of respondents fully agree that there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teaching staff competencies at the university, 13.43% - partially agree.

73.13% of the teaching staff fully agree that this educational organization has the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, 17.91% - partially agree.

50.75% of respondents are satisfied with the salary as an employee involved in the educational process.

58.21% of teachers are involved in the development of methodological materials for the residency programme. The majority of teachers surveyed (74.63%) were trained in professional development courses during this year.

62.69% of respondents believe that the discipline they teach is adequately resourced. The educational organization supports participation in conferences (international, republican). Thus, according to 29.85% of respondents, the university pays for travel, registration fee and travel allowances, according to 2.99% of respondents, only travel is paid. 76.12% of teachers fully agree that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills. Only 44.78% of respondents confirmed that the university implements social support programmes.

68.66% of respondents say that they listen to their opinions on the educational process, research and clinical work.

49.25% of the teachers surveyed use lectures in their practice, 80.6% - oral survey, 41.79% use problem-based learning, 71.64% use work in small groups. 68.66% of respondents-teachers fully agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the university's activities. According to the survey 23.88% of teachers surveyed were involved in work in internal self-assessment committee

**conclusions:** the survey showed that the majority of the teachers surveyed are satisfied with the organization of the educational process, observance of ethics and subordination, organization of labor and workplace, opportunities for career growth, the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research. However, it is alarming that about a quarter of the respondents express the opinion that there are a number of problems at the university, including the possibility of doing scientific work and publishing research results; on the level of wages; participation in the development of methodological materials; security of the discipline they teach, resources; social support programmes for teachers and taking into account their opinions regarding the educational process, research and clinical work on the part of the university management.



## **5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of educational programme in the specialty 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The university offers 35 residency specialties, and the accredited programme has been introduced since 2014.

The missions of the university and the educational programme are developed and all interested parties are informed about their content. Residents were informed about the mission through teachers and the head of the residency department Orakbai L.Zh. Basic information about the residency programme is available on the official website of the university <https://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>, schedules and other organizational documents are posted on the information stands of the university buildings, sent to residents by email and there is a WhatsApp chat. Thus, residents are constantly aware of all events planned and taking place at the university. The head of the residency department constantly maintains feedback with residents.

The university has introduced corporate governance based on the principles of collegiality and openness of decisions, separation of management bodies and their responsibilities, financial transparency (Academic Council, Academic Council, Scientific and Clinical). At the same time, the functions of top management, organization and control are assigned to the rector. The organizational structure of July 16, 2020 is posted on the website <https://krmu.edu.kz/organizatsionnaya-struktura-universiteta/> and was not updated in 2021.

The University organizes purposeful meetings with employers when coordinating educational programmes, catalogs of elective disciplines (CED). Representatives of employers are members of the Scientific and Clinical Council of the KRMU, at whose meetings issues related to the implementation of the Mission, clinical training of students, planning and implementation of research are discussed.

The final results based on the results of mastering 140 credits within 2 years are described in the Work Programme, syllabuses for students.

The university has a procedure for the development (department), discussion (committee of educational programmes), approval (academic council) and quality monitoring (the department conducts ongoing analysis of effectiveness, CEP - periodic) of the educational programme. When forming the programme, its goals, final results, a discussion was held at the level of: student audience, graduates (discussion of opportunities), department staff (discussion in the working group, at a meeting of departments / courses), at a meeting of the CEP (dated 14.05.2020 No. 5), on the Academic Council (dated August 28, 2020 No. 5) and the Academic Council of the University (dated August 12, 2020 No. 5).

The programme is implemented in conditions of accessibility of information, equality in relation to all applicants and residents, and ethics, which is supported by knowledge and Attachment of the Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics (06/01/2018) and the Student Academic Integrity Code (04/27/2019, Academic Council, Protocol No. 9), including the functioning of "Antiplagiat.VUZ".

KRMU has provided in its clinics a patient-oriented approach in the implementation of the educational programme, which allows residents to engage in daily clinical work, have constant contact with patients, study their problems in depth and learn to make independent decisions in the treatment of patients, this approach is supported by the fact that leading clinicians.

*In this way*, the supervising department has developed the mission of the educational programme, based on the best domestic and foreign practice and experience, modern trends in postgraduate medical education and the current needs of emergency and disaster medicine. The mission statement is published on the website of the university and in methodological materials, where the main interested parties (teachers, students, employers) can receive this information, as well as information about the final learning outcomes, the quality of which can be controlled and monitored through the participation of employers' representatives in the assessment of residents and graduates, regular surveys. At the same

time, considering that the mission of the educational program declares international cooperation, however, residents of the specialty "Medicine of emergencies and disasters" and teachers over the past 3 years have not published in peer-reviewed journals, have not participated in educational events on the profile of their specialty.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 16, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Active involvement of all stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and final learning outcomes of the residency educational programme (representation of residents, employers, professional associations in advisory bodies).

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

According to this standard, the model, structure, content of the educational programme, teaching and learning methods, as well as the choice of clinical sites for their compliance with the postgraduate level of education and the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" were analyzed. The educational programme has a state license, which confirms its compliance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard / SCES 2020 (140 credits: major disciplines - 132 credits, elective component - 4 credits, intermediate certification - 2 credits, final certification - 2 credits.). The educational programme complies with international requirements and the 8th level of the national qualification framework in medical education and the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area.

It has been established that the academic policy of the university is regulated by the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152) and the university model of residents' competence (modular competency-based approach to teaching residents), which is described in the educational programme. Residents and teachers are informed about the necessary competencies that both students and teachers acquire. This happens in conditions of openness and awareness of the successes of residents.

Given the large proportion of practical training (75%), the document "Regulations on mentoring" is relevant, which is the regulation for working with residents.

The university provides work (study) of a resident in the clinic with patients, starting from the 1st year of study for 2 years. Clinical sites are selected in such a way as to meet all the expectations of the resident and correspond to the disciplines of the educational programme. The trajectory of the resident's education and the stepwise approach to mastering practical skills according to the principle "from simple to complex" are described in the work programme. All residents have "on hand" syllabuses for the disciplines of the educational programme.

The totality of individual educational achievements of a resident is presented in a portfolio, the reliability and quality of which is controlled by the resident's mentor.

Residents are trained at multidisciplinary clinical sites with personal participation in the treatment and diagnostic process, both in class time and during independent work. At the same time, the relationship and sequence of studying disciplines is observed.

Thus, the disciplines - emergency therapy and pediatrics, emergency surgery, emergency traumatology at the prehospital stage (11 credits each) - are studied by residents in the clinics of Almaty, the Center for Children's Emergency Medical Care. "Fundamentals of Anesthesiology in Disaster Medicine" (11 credits) are studied on the basis of the clinic and skills are worked out to automatism in the educational and clinical (simulation) center of the university. "Epidemiology of Disasters" (15 credits) - one of the important disciplines, taking into account modern threats to society from infectious diseases and high risks of the consequences of natural disasters, in principle, can be studied at any of the clinical bases of the university, as it requires a large amount of theoretical knowledge from the resident.



At the same time, this discipline requires the development of skills in conducting activities to eliminate medical consequences in disaster areas, Therefore, it is in close contact with San Epid. services. "Civil protection and organization of medical care in emergency situations" (15 credits), "Toxicology and radiobiology (13 credits)" as disciplines of the educational programme are studied by residents on the basis of the "Emergency Service" enterprise in Almaty.

“Organization and Fundamentals of the Disaster Medicine Service” (23 credits), being in fact one of the leading disciplines, forms knowledge of the basic principles of the construction and functioning of the “emergency medicine” service (MES).

When studying the discipline "Ambulance in emergency situations" (25 credits), the resident is required to know and be able to provide first aid to victims of emergency situations, therefore this discipline is taught in the organization "Ambulance Service" (12 substations), and the main place development of skills to automatism is the educational and clinical center of the university.

The variable component / elective (4 credits) offers a choice of disciplines such as: "The work of the health care organization on the creation and maintenance of disaster medicine units", "Organization of emergency medical care for the affected population in a low-intensity war zone”, “Bringing the formations of disaster medicine into high alert and emergency modes”, “Evidence-based medicine”.

Thus, multidisciplinary clinics and emergency services have a wide profile of departments and emergency conditions, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with a variety of pathologies.

The achievement of the final learning outcomes, the development of competencies, is facilitated by such learning technologies as: seminars, webinars, conferences, case studies, problem-based learning (PBL); case-based learning (CBL), team-based learning (TBL); simulation-based training, role-playing games, brainstorming method, group discussion method, portfolio, combined survey, small group training method, simulation technologies, presentations, projects. The method “conducting an audit examination of case histories” introduced at the university allows the resident to master the skill of an expert. Implementation of scientific projects (RBL) develops the skills of a researcher, medical expert, manager.

The teaching of emergency medicine and disasters is carried out on the basis of multidisciplinary clinics, which allows residents to get a holistic view of patients with various pathologies. This helps residents to obtain good clinical practice, the ability to think independently and be able to work independently at a high professional level after graduation.

The scientific component of the educational programme is reflected in the document itself, but at the same time it needs to be developed in the form of initiation. Small research projects for residents. While the residents of the accredited programme do not have enough skills to perform research and prepare analytical reviews. Social projects and involvement in the volunteer movement as part of professional activities are useful for strengthening the theoretical part of the programme and can be an example for other universities. Thus, in April 2021, residents participated in the project for the vaccination of the population on the basis of the Mobile Medical Complex located on the territory of the Central Clinical Hospital in Almaty. Among the checklists of the resident's activities, there is a checklist for assessing the conduct of sanitary and educational work with patients.

*In this way*, the university has defined a model of an educational residency programme based on competencies, while the content of the residency programme complies with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The basis of training for residents is a student-centered approach and practice orientation, which is confirmed by a sufficient fund of accredited clinical sites, access to clinic resources, and a variety of thematic patients. The residency programme is implemented on the basis of the principles of quality, academic integrity and anti-plagiarism policy, in accordance with the principles of equality. At the same time, the training of residents is limited to 2-3 clinical bases and the resources of medical organizations specializing in problems related to emergency situations are not used.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: fully - 29, partially - 1.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Consider the possibility of training residents at the Center for Disaster Medicine of the MED of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The university uses a standard approach to assessing residents, as in many medical universities in Kazakhstan, which includes: current and midterm monitoring of progress, intermediate certification of residents and final state certification. This is due to the fact that all medical universities adhere to regulatory legal acts in the field of education.

The educational achievements of residents are evaluated on a 100-point scale with the corresponding digital equivalent on a 4-point scale.

General policy, principles, methods for assessing residents by specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" are reflected in the internal documents of the university: Academic policy of the university, Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students

Current supervision is carried out by a teacher or clinical mentor. Assessment methods are carried out according to checklists developed by the department and reflected in syllabuses. Portfolios are used as an assessment of scientific activity and are designed quite voluminously and meaningfully.

Intermediate attestation of residents is carried out in accordance with the academic calendar, working curriculum and educational programmes developed on the basis of the State Educational Standards and standard curricula for residency specialties.

The organization of the system for monitoring the educational achievements of residents is carried out by the Office of the Registrar, which keeps a history of the educational achievements of students throughout the entire period of study, which is reflected in the transcript. The transcript is issued at the request of the student for any period of his training.

During the Final State Certification of Residents, leading specialists from other universities and practical health care are involved as chairperson and members of the certification commission. So, 3 graduates of residency in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" in 2021 successfully passed the exams and received a specialist certificate.

A student who disagrees with the result of the exam files an appeal in accordance with the procedure specified in the Academic Policy. Since 2014 (the first set of residents for specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine") there were no precedents on appeal.

An independent assessment of the knowledge of internship and residency graduates has been carried out since 2015. Residents successfully pass this assessment.

After the exams, a survey of residents is conducted to study their opinions about the quality of teaching the discipline, the exam procedure, the results of the certification are analyzed by the department and at a meeting of the committee of educational programmes (CEP).

*In this way*, the university defines and publishes the principles and methods for assessing residents, which cover knowledge, skills and professional behavior. There is a system for appealing the final results of the assessment, which is documented. The university has a practice of involving external examiners in the assessment of residents, which ensures transparency and objectivity of the assessment results.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 11 standards conform: fully - 11.

**Standard 3: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Improve the procedure for documenting the reliability and validity of assessment methods and formats in relation to established outcomes.

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The University has formulated and implemented the "Rules for admission to residency", including in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", which are based on the "Model rules for admission to study in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education" (MES RK, 31 October 2018 No. 600) and take into account the rights of all segments of the population and nationalities. As in all medical universities in Kazakhstan, KRMU places an advertisement for admission to residency on the university website in the section "Admission Committee" - "Residency". All information is available to applicants. The time frame for accepting applications, considering an Attachment, entrance exams, enrollment and the start of classes is carried out in accordance with state regulations and in sync with all medical organizations of postgraduate education in the country.

Prior to admission to residency, the university conducts an analysis of the compliance of the resource base of the specialty with the educational programme, collects applications for the purchase of educational literature and equipment from the departments.

The number of places in the residency is determined based on the possibilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical health care. According to the programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", the need for specialists is not as high as, for example, in the specialty "General Practitioner" and all 5 residents are studying **for a fee**.

The criteria for applicants entering residency are determined by the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan (2017, 2020), according to which the previous level of education of persons wishing to master educational residency programmes: basic medical education, higher medical education, internship.

The university provides support to students in the event of a professional crisis, the need to solve problem situations among residents, a fundamental disagreement with the curator or colleagues, and has appointed the residency department responsible for this. There is a document "Regulations on the social support of students", approved in 2019, but mainly applied to undergraduate students, since they are more vulnerable in this regard. All service information is available on the website.

A significant support for the employment of residency graduates is the University Career Center. In principle, the residents themselves "probe" this process and study the options for their employment in advance. Thus, according to the reports of the Career Center, in 2017, 91% of residency graduates were employed, in 2018 - 66%, in 2019 - 74%, in 2020 city (despite the pandemic) - 94%.

*In this way*, at the university the relationship between the mission and the selection of residents, and a balance is struck between the available training opportunities and the recruitment of residents. The university implements a policy of admission to residency and transfer of residents from other universities. The admission policy is in line with the national legislation in the field of postgraduate education. There is an appeal procedure against the decision of the selection committee, but there were no precedents for appeal during the reporting period. Academic counseling for residents and support for career planning is carried out systematically and transparently. It is possible to draw up an individual training programme for residents under special circumstances, for example, for residents with work experience, an individual learning path may be offered.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 30 standards conform: fully 30.

***Standard 4: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

- 1) Ensure the participation of the proper number of residents in the collegial advisory bodies responsible for formulating the mission of the educational programme and the final learning outcomes;
- 2) Activate the programme "Academic mobility of students".

## **Standard 5: FACULTY**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

Approaches to the selection, admission, development and promotion of teachers are analyzed. The university has developed a document "Personnel Policy". Upon admission to the university, the applicant must confirm their qualifications and provide a portfolio. Recruitment criteria are open and consistent with legal requirements and established tenures. Over the past 2-3 years, the degree of teachers has increased, including residency programmes, and today it is more than 67%. This is due to the transfer of teachers with a scientific degree from other medical universities in Almaty to the KRMU.

The total number of teaching staff is formed on the basis of the average ratio of residents and teachers - 3:1. The course "Medicine of Emergency Situations" includes 2 full-time employees, one with a PhD degree, the 1st Master of Science. There are 5 residents in total for the current academic year.

In order to carry out professional and pedagogical improvement, the School of Teachers, the Institute of Postgraduate Education (IPE) function at the university, winter and summer schools are held annually during the holidays.

A professional development programme based on the IPE is passed by each employee-teacher with a break from the main activity once every five years. For employees who wish to undergo training on the job, training is conducted 27 hours a week, or according to a specially established schedule. The participation of teachers in advanced training programmes is reflected in the individual reports and plans of teachers, and is monitored internally by the departmental control. Upon completion of advanced training, reports or documents confirming training (certificates) are provided.

The system of external evaluation, monitoring of the work of the teacher and the achievement of the intermediate and final result of the educational programme for residency is carried out through the annual certification of teachers in all types of activities, including work on residency.

In order to motivate teachers at the university, the competition "The Best Teacher" is annually held with various nominations, lists of nominees for awarding state awards and certificates are formed.

*In this way*, the university implements a policy of recruitment and admission of teachers, supervisors and clinical mentors with relevant documentation (Regulations, job descriptions, individual work plans for teachers). In the personnel policy, the university takes into account the goals and objectives of the educational programme, the postgraduate level of education. The programme for the development of teachers and mentors is carried out regularly and has motivation mechanisms for retaining teachers at the university. To systematically improve the quality of education in residency, a periodic assessment of the activities of teachers (attestation) is carried out.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 7 standards conform: fully - 6, partially - 1.

***Standard 5: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

- 1) Improvement of pedagogical skills through participation in the Programme of academic mobility of teachers to universities and research centers of near and far abroad;
- 2) Develop approaches and increase the number of publications with Impact-factor;
- 3) Develop and implement assessment criteria that characterize the activities of teachers and clinical mentors.

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The logistics of the university for the purposes and objectives of the residency programme in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" includes premises and equipment available to residents in the main clinical base of this programme (enterprise "Emergency Service"), with which a long-term contract has been concluded. The training rooms of the unit called "Emergency Medicine Course" are equipped with all the necessary equipment, visual aids, educational material in paper and electronic form, methodological developments for each discipline, and teachers use active and interactive teaching methods.

In the office of "information and communication technologies", which consists of 3 study rooms (12 seats), residents can use computers and printers to prepare presentations, creative projects, reports as part of extracurricular activities.

There is a Test Center with 122 computers and a licensed Examiner programme for midterm and final control of knowledge. In the premises of the Test Center, control over the observance of order and discipline of students is carried out in accordance with the academic integrity of the university (12 video surveillance cameras).

For the formation of practical and communicative competencies of students, since 2011, the Training and Clinical Center (TCC) has been operating, which includes 11 specialized rooms with a total area of 190 m<sup>2</sup> with appropriate simulation equipment and equipment.

Mobile medical complexes (PMCs) are also a "real" platform for developing and improving clinical skills in providing emergency medical care, for example, in case of prolonged compression syndrome (crash syndrome) as part of the objectives of the educational programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine".

The Department of Financial Work is called upon to analyze applications from departments and determine the feasibility of planned purchases, repairs and acquisitions in order to continuously improve educational resources.

Safe training and a safe environment for residents on the territory of the main buildings of the university are provided by the Security Service Department and the paramilitary guards of Bars LLP. Employees enter the university building with magnetic passes, students with student ID cards, and visitors with ID cards. During a visual inspection of the university premises, experts on each floor of the main building found evacuation plans and directions for a safe exit in case of civil defense, emergency situations, fire, there are signs of a safe place in case of an earthquake. Clinical (practical) training bases have their own security service. This is guaranteed by the fact that residents are trained in accredited clinics.

The University has signed cooperation agreements with 85 medical organizations. located in the city of Almaty, Almaty region and regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, therefore, the training programme for residents in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" has the prospect of training not only in 2-3 clinics.

The university has formed bases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the internal network of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle.

The University Library Fund is also universal in that it consists of documents placed on remote technical means.

Partnerships have been established with 11 foreign universities of the Republic of Belarus, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Russian Federation, Turkey and France, at the same time, residents do not participate in academic mobility due to a discrepancy in loans (volume of teaching load) in educational programmes with foreign educational organizations.

*In this way*, the university provides appropriate conditions and opportunities for theoretical and practical training of residents, while regularly assessing and updating the material and technical equipment and equipment, replenishing the library fund, increasing the number of clinical bases to access a sufficient number of patients. Residents are provided with access to web resources and electronic learning tools, and the distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle. The clinical orientation of residency training justifies working in a team of fellow residents and other health care professionals. There are opportunities for academic exchange between partner organizations.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 20, partially - 1  
***Standard 6: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) Consider the possibility of training residents at the Center for Disaster Medicine of the MED of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The university has developed and applies a system for assessing the quality of the residency educational programme, including an assessment of: the content of the programme (compliance with state educational standards, curriculum, standard programmes of disciplines, syllabuses), management (departments, residency department), organization of the educational process (department, clinical base, educational technologies ,), the level of achievement of the goals of the programme (performance, the results of the intermediate and final certification, the demand for and employment of graduates), educational resources (methodological and information support, research).

At each stage of the assessment of the quality of the residency educational programme, there is a unit responsible for this stage, starting with the profiling department (the course of the MED), then the residency department, the Committee for Educational Programmes of Postgraduate Education, the Department for Academic Work, the Academic Council, the Academic Council, the Career Center (general monitoring the quality of educational programmes through stakeholder surveys).

All stages are coordinated with each other and may not always be consistent.

The university has a procedure for planning, developing and approving the educational programme, and quality assessment is carried out at each stage: a) the analysis of the relevance of the programme before development is carried out by the department, b) the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers and the adaptation of the programme to the needs of practical health care, c) review - external and internal) monitoring during the implementation of the programme through surveys of residents, e) studying the opinions of respondents and making adjustments to the educational programme.

For example, to assess the adequacy of the teaching methods used, the department in charge of the educational programme analyzes the degree (level) of the residents' achievement of practical skills and / or the acquisition and consolidation of relevant knowledge, the formation of which was carried out using a specific teaching methodology. Conclusions are drawn to what extent this method fits the goals and objectives of the discipline (theme).

Constant work is carried out to determine the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the university. The total number of respondents in the 2020-2021 academic year is 164 residents, including 5 under the programme "Emergency and Disaster Medicine". The level of satisfaction with clinical practice is 4 points out of 5. There is an Action Plan to improve the satisfaction and expectations of university consumers based on the analysis of a survey to assess student satisfaction with the conditions of study at the university.

In 2021, the Career Center conducted a sociological study "Satisfaction of employers with graduates". 30 employers were interviewed (response rate 60%) from 6 regions and the city of Almaty. The results of the survey showed that not a single employer rated the quality of training as low. 100% of residency graduates are employed in medical organizations at the place of internship.

The university website contains information about available educational programmes (<http://medkrmu.kz/>). For feedback from teachers and residents, the rector's blog is used. Representatives of residents are members of the CEP, the Academic Council, where they participate in the discussion of the implementation of the educational programme.

*In this way*, the university has a system for assessing the quality of the educational programme, which defines the mechanisms for evaluating the programme, taking into account the mission (goals and objectives), the expected end results of teaching residents, the content of the educational programme, teaching methods, sufficiency and appropriateness of educational resources. Questionnaires and surveys of teachers, residents, employers are actively used as tools for assessing the quality of the programme, and the results feedback analysis to improve the educational programme. All feedback results are available for review by teachers and staff responsible for the reception of residents and planning the educational programme.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 15 standards conform: completely - 15.

*Standard 7: completed*

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) Improve the process of monitoring and evaluation of educational programmes by developing an appropriate document (regulations, rules, regulations) and the wide involvement of residents, employers and other stakeholders in the evaluation of the educational programme.

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

The main for the effective and balanced activity of the university is the organizational structure approved in 2020, posted on the website of the university, where the residency programme is managed by the residency department under the supervision of the vice-rector for scientific and clinical activities and the corresponding clinical departments (courses). The head of the residency department is an experienced and qualified specialist and manager with an academic degree and authority among students and teachers.

The Strategic Development Plan of the National Educational Institution KazRosmeduniversitet and the Quality Policy and Objectives are the main documents that guarantee continuous improvement and quality assurance of education.

The university applies approved documents (regulations, rules, job descriptions, plans, etc.) that define the scope of duties and powers of departments and employees of the university in relation to the educational programme of residency, including obligations to ensure the educational process in full with all the necessary educational, personnel and information resources.

There are an integrated quality management system (IQMS), a system for collecting feedback from stakeholders, collegial advisory bodies, a website with information pages about the residency educational programme, which ensures transparency of management.

Office work at the university, regulating and documenting all processes related to the implementation of the programme in the specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine", is confirmed by the presence of a working curriculum for the specialty, a schedule of training sessions and an individual curriculum of a resident.

The activities of the departments (the course of the MED) regarding the fulfillment of the mission and the solution of the problems of the educational programme are studied and evaluated on the basis of the analysis and formation of annual plans and reports. The assessment of the organization of training at the department is carried out through planned and systematic control by the residency department.

The calculation of the teaching load of teachers is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Order No. 647 of July 31, 2015) and is approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University. At present, the teaching load of the teaching staff ranges from 600 (professor) to 680 (teacher) hours.

Students who have completed a residency programme in their specialty 7R01135 "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" and successfully passed the state certification, a state document is issued on the qualification of a doctor in the specialty "medicine of emergency situations".

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (the state order for the training of personnel for higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and the provision of paid educational services.

*In this way*, the educational programme is conducted in accordance with the requirements of the regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents, the learning process, the assessment of knowledge and skills, the development and management of the programme. The university is responsible for the implementation of the programme and provides conditions for quality education. All processes regarding the management and budgeting of the educational programme are transparent and the responsibilities and duties of the residency department are defined.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 15

*Standard 8: completed*

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) Improvement of financing mechanisms for all levels of education (academic mobility of residents, participation of residents in international events).

**Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

**Evidence of Compliance:**

The university, when implementing educational activities with the involvement of relevant stakeholders, initiates a procedure for regular review and updating of the process, structure, content, learning outcomes, competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, the learning environment of the programme, and allocates resources for continuous improvement.

The university development programme provides for continuous analysis and assessment of the quality of the educational and medical activities of the university through a systematic analysis of the ISMC, monitoring feedback from service consumers to determine their degree of satisfaction, and modernizing the communication system at the university.

Analysis of the QMS allows you to assess the opportunities for improvement and the need for changes in the quality management system, identify existing problems and develop a system of measures to improve it and the need for changes.

An inspection audit of the QMS is carried out annually university for compliance with the requirements of MA ISO 9001:2015.

The management of the university constantly monitors and analyzes the organizational structure of the university in accordance with the ongoing reforms in the field of education and health care in the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management.

According to the development of university plans, distributes resources, provides sufficient financial support for the development of the material and technical base, library, information resources and technologies.

The financial stability of the university ensures the implementation of the main activities and development of the university based on capital growth at the expense of budgetary and extrabudgetary revenues while maintaining solvency under an acceptable level of risk. Both in relative and absolute terms, it has normal financial stability, and, having a sufficient level of financial stability, is able to pay off all its obligations in a short time, successfully operates and develops.

The use of RBL teaching technology in the educational process makes it possible to develop the skills of scientific research among residents.

In order to improve the management system in the University and overcoming the functional deficiencies of management, the management of the university annually reviews its organizational structure.

Quality Policy university is aimed at ensuring the competitiveness of the university in the educational services market, focusing on the introduction of innovative methods and technologies in the training of resident specialists, and the provision of high-tech medical services. The quality policy is maintained to meet the established requirements, constantly improved and adapted, periodically supplemented in accordance with the ongoing state reforms in the field of health care and education, and the country's policy documents.

Graduates of residency by specialty "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" are able to apply their knowledge and skills immediately after graduation from the university.

The EEC got acquainted with the regulatory documentation during the preparation of the visit, analysis of the self-assessment report and received confirmation during the visit of the EEC.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 4 standards conform: fully - 4.

***Standard 9: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: No***



## **6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine":**

### ***Standard 1:***

1) Active involvement of all stakeholders in the formulation of the mission and final learning outcomes of the residency educational programme (representation of residents, employers, professional associations in advisory bodies).

### ***Standard 2:***

2) Consider the possibility of training residents at the Center for Disaster Medicine of the MED of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

### ***Standard 3:***

3) Improve the procedure for documenting the reliability and validity of assessment methods and formats in relation to established outcomes.

### ***Standard 4:***

4) Ensure the participation of the proper number of residents in the collegial advisory bodies responsible for formulating the mission of the educational programme and the final learning outcomes;  
5) Activate the programme "Academic mobility of students".

### ***Standard 5:***

6) Improvement of pedagogical skills through participation in the Programme of academic mobility of teachers to universities and research centers of near and far abroad;  
7) Develop approaches and increase the number of publications with Impact-factor;  
8) Develop and implement assessment criteria that characterize the activities of teachers and clinical mentors.

### ***Standard 7:***

9) Improve the process of monitoring and evaluation of educational programmes by developing an appropriate document (regulations, rules, regulations) and the wide involvement of residents, employers and other stakeholders in the evaluation of the educational programme.

### ***Standard 8:***

10) Improvement of financing mechanisms for all levels of education (academic mobility of residents, participation of residents in international events).

### **7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

EEC members determined the compliance of the educational programme 7R01135 - "Emergency and Disaster Medicine" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

	<b>Full name</b>
Chairperson	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna
foreign expert	Oleg Mikhailovich Uryasiev
foreign expert	Khasanov Adkham Ibragimovich
Kazakh academic expert	Magzumova Raushangul Ziyadinovna
Employers' representative	Musabayeva Asem Muratovna
Resident Representative	Ziya Azimkhan Nurzhanuly

ECAQA Observer Umarova M.A.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

one	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	Grade		
			Totally coincides	Partially Compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	16	1	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1	
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4.	STUDENTS	30	30		
5.	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1	
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>150</b>	<b>146</b>	<b>4</b>	
			<b>150</b>		

## List of documents reviewed by EEC

No.	Document names	Quantity	Date of approval (if applicable)
1.	Academic policy	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
2.	Regulations on the current control, intermediate and final certification of students of the NEI KRMU	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
3.	Rules for admission to residency	1	Pr. 7 dated 07/01/2020
4.	Regulations on academic mobility of students, teachers and staff	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
5.	Regulations on the clinical mentor	1	Minutes of the SCC No. 18 dated 17.06.2019
6.	Quality Policy and Objectives	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 08/27/2021
7.	Strategic Development Plan of the National Educational Institution KRMU for 2019-2025	1	Pr. 96 dated 04/17/2019
8.	Formation, discussion, approval of the academic calendar	1	Etc. No. 1 dated 18.08.2021
9.	Approval of candidates for chairperson and composition of the SEC and SAC	1	Order No. 26-02-48-n/k dated 02.12.2020
10.	Personnel policy	1	SC No. 5 12/25/2020
11.	Internal regulations for students of NJSC KRMU	1	Etc. No. 347/1 dated 12/12/2017
12.	Regulations on the Institute of Postgraduate Education of the National Educational Institution of the Kyrgyz Republic	1	01/09/2020
13.	Residency Student Handbook 2021-2022 academic year		08/18/2021
14.	Tactical plan of NJSC KRMU in the field of quality for 2020-2021	1	Minutes No. 1 dated 28.08.2020
15.	Organizational structure of NJSC KRMU	1	Etc. No. 11 dated 06/29/2020
16.	Educational programme in the specialty of residency	1	Pr. 0/1 dated 18.08.2021
17.	Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics	1	Etc. No. 4 dated 11/26/2021
18.	Regulations on the Committee of Educational Programmes	1	AC meeting dated 06.12.2021
19.	Code of academic honor for students of NJSC KRMU	1	Etc. No. 9 dated 04/27/2019
20.	Portfolio of residents 1,2,3 courses	9	08/31/2021
21.	Syllabuses by disciplines of residency specialty	3	08/31/2021

22.	Gradebooks	1	Electronic variant
23.	The annual plan of the department for 2021-2022 academic year	1	01.09.2021
24.	Individual Resident Plan	6	08/31/2021
25.	Schedule of cathedral meetings for the 2021-2022 academic year	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
26.	Minutes of cathedral meetings 2021-2022 academic year	4	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
27.	Evaluation sheets of resident doctors	2	
28.	syllabuses	3	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
29.	List of scientific works of resident maxillofacial surgeons	1	
30.	Agreements with clinical bases	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
31.	Review of test items	2	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021
32.	The list of control questions of midterm control	1	Pr. 1 dated 27.08.2021